

醫學教育的園丁： 如何培養學生的倫理與品格

戴正德

tai@csmu.edu.tw

I. Preface

Can we proudly say that our education is a successful one ?

Do we have a problem in terms of molding students ' character ? Yet is it the responsibility of university education ?

Basically, education has three goals : (according to ancient thinker Han-yi)

傳道 (家庭教育,國民教育,公民社會..)

授業(專科,大學,研究所...)

解惑(家庭教育,國民教育,公民社會..)

大學教育也必須思考 學生的倫理情操與品格?...

University seems to bear all responsibilities in Taiwan as society will blame us whenever any problem/incident occurs.

For instance :

Last year's incidents at KMUH and Changkung H plus others, impelled the Control Yuan to demand the Ministry of Education to explain what is medical ethics and why our medical education fails to produce morally sound physicians in society to serve the wellbeing of people. The question:

The question from the Control Yuan:

- 何謂「醫學倫理」？貴部及各公私立醫學院如何透過學士前的醫學教育過程，強化落實醫學倫理？相關評估機制？據瞭解，財團法人醫院評鑑暨醫療品質策進會所規定「醫學倫理」課程之上課時數徒具形式，無助於「醫學倫理」之實踐。則貴部及各公私立醫學院對此有何意見？

Although this question targeted at medical schools, all levels of school in Taiwan should ponder upon and answer the inquiry, but it demanded only Ministry of Education to respond, seemingly that school, especially university, should bear the major responsibility in terms of students' character cultivation.

Has our education indeed failed or are there other factors undermining the efficiency of our teaching ?

Morris Massey, award-winning education trainer and sociologist has this famous saying:

“what you are is where you were
when ”

which clearly indicates that environment (placement) is one of the determinant factors of one's value formation

II. Ethics and Character

1. Ethics as ethos—custom, character... values practices of a culture based on contextualized emphasis of what importance in life
2. Sense of value such as truth, goodness, beauty and justice or Jen, Yi, Li, Chu, Sin..
3. Character is external expression of each individual's implementation of these values in daily living.

- Is ethos or character congenital or learned ?
- The debate has been going on for ages and still charging.
- Indeed, some are congenital while others learned but what Morris Massey said seems to imply it is more of an acquisition than of being habitually given

Value Development

- Morris described three major periods during which values are developed:
- 1. Modeling period: up to age 7, absorbing things like sponges accepting them as true especially when it comes from parents.
- 2. Socializing period: from 8-13, copy people often from parents ,much impressed with religion and teachers.
- 3. Between 13-21:influenced by peers and media espeically that resonates with values of peer groups

Value Development:

Lawrence Kohlberg gave a good analysis based on Jean Piaget's theory:

- i. we are born with a series of undifferentiated potential of value, e.g. capacity to learn language not prescribed by genetic heritage
- ii. value development is a product of our interaction with our cultural environment that is closely tied to one's cognitive and psychomotor development

iii. Three stages:

a. Pre-conventional (age 2-7) :

child responds to the prevailing cultural value of right and wrong, good and evil

Phase 1: accept the authority of others,

e.g. I do so because I will be punished otherwise.

Phase 2: begin to direct activities toward the

satisfaction of personal needs. e.g. I do so because I will be rewarded

b. Conventional (age 7-12): conform to societal expectation of family group or nation in order to win the approval of authority figures.

Phase 1: good boy/girl orientation to conform to expectation. e.g; **I do so because those care about me will be very proud of me and happy**

Phase 2: focus on moral and social orders, respect for authority. Right behavior is one's duty. e.g. **I do so because as a member of family/society,** it is my duty that promotes social harmony and order.

c. Post-conventional (12 to above): abstract qualities such as justice, dignity... are important. One's conscience becomes final arbiter in dilemmas.

Phase 1; I do so because a member of society needs to be responsible to others that promotes social well-being

Phase 2: I do so because my conscience tells me so. The universal ethics demands my accorded response.

- At this stage a person becomes morally autonomous and decides what is right through conscience. Yet not everyone develops up to this stage. Some stops during the conventional stage or even pre-conventional.

iv. two differences: e.g. boys and girls (Carol Gilligan):

boys (thinking category) tend to find a legalistic rational e.g. to steal the medicine that was refused

girls (feeling category) tend to base on relationship, e.g. to return and explain and believe that help will be given that was refused.

- v. Value development theory reminds us that:
 - a. critical period of value system programming is between birth and the teen.
 - b. most of value system is firmly in place by the age 12, in Taiwan perhaps around 15.
 - c. general ethics education must begin at young age with the help of a spontaneously altruistic social environment.

The Power of Cultural Influence:

- The whole world has been impressed by the orderly response of Japanese people to the earthquake disaster last month (March, 2011).
- The so-called “ Fukushima 50 “ indicated that something virtuous indeed exists in human kind.
- Let’s see these pictures with a comparison:





銀座駅
Ginza Sta.









大震災
被災

スーパ

このすさまじい地震を

- Let's compare with others:













- We can find more chaotic and gross evidences that show the greedy and selfish egoism in many incidents in the world including Taiwan.
- Why such difference ? Think about what would have happened to us or to China if similar tragedy happens ? Will it be as orderly or will it be chaotic ?

- The way Japanese responded is grounded on their traditional ethos that reflects the spirit of Bushido or Shintoism that is blended in Japanese way of living rather than just preaching and boasting without evidences.

- Shintoism believes humans are servants of family, state and ancestors. An individual is never isolated but always a part of an extended family and a national people.
- Bushido has five tenets: loyalty, courage, honor, politeness, and benevolence. These tenets become the virtues that every Japanese must pursue. We saw these virtues prevailed at their crucial time.
- National/cultural ethos plays a major role in character formation.

- These were the comments on Japanese reaction to the earthquake on TIME, April 18,2011:
- “..first they endured and then they recovered...because in Japan, it is not about ‘me’ but ‘about ‘us’ “. (Paul Kendall, US)
- “..about the resolve and fortitude of the Japanese people...we take pride in working hard and as a team, no matter how difficult a situation...the earthquake and tsunami may have taken away our shelter, clothes and food but one thing they can never take away is our samurai spirit.” (Gaku Imamura, Japan)

A Reflection...

- We also have 四維八德,仁,義,禮,智,信....
- Do our ethos exist only in book or politicians' mouths ? If not blended in life, splendid slogans remain as lip services.
- What kind of social, educational and moral environments do we have especially after WWII ?

- **“ You are what you are because of where you were when ” (Morris Massey)**
- **“ what you are is where you were when ”**

醫學教育的園丁：

如何培養學生的倫理與品格

- 1. We basically are a bunch of good people. Mencius tells us: We are commiserational being who cannot see the suffering of others.
- 2. Are our social ethos strong enough ? In other word, where is the Environment ? Where are the role models ?
- “Say one thing yet do another” is typical of Taiwanese society

According to the theory we discussed earlier, we have to ask:

1. Are university students too late to learn the trick ?
(you cannot teach old dog new trick)
2. what can we do with the remaining of 10-15% of potential character formation ?
 - a. How do we teach ethics ?
 - b. what are the content of general education ?
knowledge as a discipline ?
 - c. character formation, character cultivation ? any
role model ?
 - d. A debate this year –
Tiger Mother (Tough Love)
Soft Love (le miserable)

3. Four dimension of general ethics education
 - a. Awareness (conscience arising)
 - b. Attitude modification,
 - c. Character cultivation (self-reflection, altruism)
 - d. Application (volunteerism, to be with the less fortunate..)

4. Learn from examples: role models, mentors, discipleship (Bonhoeffer's Imitation of Christ), apprenticeship.....

5. External enforcement (law), virtues and innate cultivation (self-reflection)

6. The innate nature (virtues or ethics) that is supposed to be part of life has become a discipline
7. Ethics has two dimensions: intellectual and virtuous (character)
 - i. Bioethics ranges from medical, ecological (environmental) and social...
 - ii. In medical ethics it extends from theoretical study, clinical ethics, health management ethics and research ethics.

III. The Development of value formation— When and how does one learn ethics ?

1. Three major theories:
social learning--
cognitive structural--
character formation—

2. Four Rectifications

四正: one to self
one to others
one to nature
one to heaven

Return to the Goodness of Physician

Dr. Sherwood Nuland, the world-widely respected physician and philosopher of medicine recently called for

--- A Return to the Goodness of Physicians.

Motivating students to ponder in order to invoke the inner virtues, in addition to the appearance of role models are what we need.

Three Approaches to attempt:

- 1) 動之以情: to evoke & foster the innate commiseration within each student so as to spontaneously **empathize** in his/her clinical practice.
- 2) 說之以理: to convince & equip students with understanding & knowledge of the ethical way to do things. (from knowing to doing)
- 3) 訴之以法: to introduce the legal aspect of the expected behavior. The last resort is law.
when appealing to commiseration & theory fail.

Kam-sia.

An-chu-se.